

DEBATE: "Should Women Be Allowed to Fight in Wars?"

SKILL: Evaluating Arguments and Identifying Persuasive Strategies, page 1 of 5

Building an Argument

A strong argument, and the claims within it, should be based on solid reasoning and backed up by supporting evidence. As a reader, your job is to trace a writer's arguments and decide whether the claims he or she makes are well-supported. **Directions:** Read "Should Women Be Allowed to Fight in Wars?" on page 19. Then complete the graphic organizer below. If you identify a claim that is not supported by evidence, write "no evidence."

"YES" by Catherine Ross

Argument: Women should be allowed in combat.

Claim 1: *Women have already been serving in combat.*

Supporting Evidence:

- *The writer served in a Civil Affairs detachment in Iraq where she "went everywhere the infantry soldiers did, lived as they did, and faced the same dangers they did."*
-

Add at least one more piece of supporting evidence.

How well does the writer support claim 1? Explain.

DEBATE: "Should Women Be Allowed to Fight in Wars?"

SKILL: Evaluating Arguments and Identifying Persuasive Strategies, page 2 of 5

"YES" by Catherine Ross (continued)

Argument: Women should be allowed in combat.

Claim 2:

Write
another
claim.

Supporting Evidence:

How well does the writer support claim 2? Explain.

SPACE FOR USE IN THEIR CLASSROOMS. ©2013 BY SCHOLASTIC INC. ALL RIGHTS RESERVED.

ADUQ PROJECTOR, OR TRANSPARENCY MASTER FOR OVERHEAD PROJECTOR. SCHOLASTIC INC. GRANTS SUBSCRIBERS OF SCHOLASTIC SCOPE PERMISSION TO RE-

USES: GCPH

DEBATE: "Should Women Be Allowed to Fight in Wars?"

SKILL: Evaluating Arguments and Identifying Persuasive Strategies, page 3 of 5

"NO" by Elaine Donnelly

Argument:

Write Donnelly's argument.

Claim 1: *Women are not physically suited for combat.*

Supporting Evidence:

- *Equipment can weigh up to 100 pounds, but women on average have "45 to 50 percent less upper-body strength [than men]."*
-

Add at least one more piece of supporting evidence.

How well does the writer support claim 1? Explain.

DEBATE: "Should Women Be Allowed to Fight in Wars?"

SKILL: Evaluating Arguments and Identifying Persuasive Strategies, page 4 of 5

"NO" by Elaine Donnelly (continued)

Argument:

Claim 2:

Write
another
claim.

Supporting Evidence:

How well does the writer support claim 2? Explain.

DEBATE: "Should Women Be Allowed to Fight in Wars?"

SKILL: Evaluating Arguments and Identifying Persuasive Strategies, page 5 of 5

Directions: Now that you've analyzed how each writer supports her argument, think about the strategies that each writer uses to convince you, the reader, that she is right. Fill in the chart below.

PERSUASIVE STRATEGY	CATHERINE ROSS Argument: Women should be allowed to serve in combat.	ELAINE DONNELLY Argument: Women should not be allowed to serve in combat.
<p>LOGOS logic, numbers, facts, and data</p>	<p>LOGIC: Women have already been serving in combat "out of necessity," so it's been proved they can do it.</p> <p>FACT: Women in Canada and Israel serve in combat roles.</p>	
<p>PATHOS appeals to the reader's emotions</p>		
<p>ETHOS authors' efforts to make themselves seem credible</p>		

Think about Deborah Sampson from *The Secret Soldier*. Circle at least two strategies above that you think Deborah could use to argue that women should be allowed in combat. (Keep in mind that she lived in the 18th century.)
Now answer the writing prompt on page 18. Be sure to use the strategies you circled above.

